



PON Città Metropolitane 2014-2020

Servizio di valutazione indipendente a favore dell'Autorità di Gestione del PON Città Metropolitane 2014 – 2020 con riguardo agli interventi dell'Asse 3 del PON Metro

Report Finale Indagine n. 1 – Rilevazione degli indicatori di risultato e analisi degli indicatori di output e di risultato dell'Asse 3 del PON Metro e supporto alla redazione della Relazione Annuale di Attuazione (RAA)

[Versione in inglese dell'Executive Summary](#)

Regolamento (UE) n. 1303/2013 - articoli 72, 122 e Allegato XII
Regolamento (UE) n. 1011/2014- articolo 3 e Allegato III

Versione 1.0 del 15.04.2023

L'indagine è stata condotta dal Raggruppamento Temporaneo di Imprese
IRS – Istituto per la Ricerca Sociale (capofila) e PTSCLAS



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This Report presents the results of **Survey 1**, which was aimed at assessing the effectiveness of the projects financed under Axis 3 of the National Operational Programme (NOP) Metropolitan Cities 2014-2020, through the quantification of the result indicators of each Investment Priority as of 31 December 2022.

More specifically, the survey had the objective of verifying **the improvement in the condition of the recipients of the social inclusion projects** 12 months after the end of their participation in the projects, in order to assess a change with respect to their initial condition: the exit from housing difficulties (Actions 3.1.1, 3.2.1, 3.2.2), the improvement in the employment condition (in terms of finding a job) or employability through the acquisition of a professional qualification (Actions 3.1.1, 3.2.1, 3.4.1) or the exit from a pre-existing condition of exclusion (Action 3.3.1). The survey did not involve Action 3.5.1, for which the result indicator IR19b "Share of recipients supported in total population of the municipalities" can be quantified from administrative sources and therefore does not require an *ad hoc* survey.

The survey data necessary for the quantification of the result indicators were collected through the Intermediate Bodies, Implementing bodies, and beneficiaries. Interviews and focus groups with the key players of the different metropolitan cities were also conducted, aimed at: i) obtaining more in-depth information on the projects implemented; ii) identifying obstacles that might have arisen during the implementation of the actions as well as the possible solutions adopted by the Metropolitan Cities; iii) allowing a better interpretation of the results.

By adopting methodological choices in full continuity with the surveys carried out in previous years to ensure the necessary comparability over time, the results were quantified according to the operational definitions of the specific indicators shared by the Intermediate Bodies. These definitions consider the heterogeneity of the expected results of the various projects implemented in different cities.

In fact, due to the highly experimental nature of the NOP Metropolitan Cities it was necessary to measure the results achieved using composite indicators, according to an "incremental success" perspective that takes into account the different starting conditions of the recipient at the time of access to the path/intervention/service and the continuous improvement of their situation until the

full achievement of the expected outcome, according to a logic of evolution based on the achievement of intermediate steps. The achieved (and measurable) success of the recipient in some cases matches the expected final result (for example, an independent housing solution maintained in full autonomy), while for more disadvantaged persons it is often represented by an intermediate stage, often essential for the achievement of the final result. This interpretation is particularly suitable for those Actions that stand out for having more difficulty in achieving the final result measured by the indicator (as in the case of full housing autonomy for the homeless participating in Action 3.2.2) or for being particularly innovative (such as Action 3.3.1, which finances interventions of an extremely varied nature and with very heterogeneous specific objectives). In any case, the interpretation is fully applicable to the NOP Metropolitan Cities as a whole.

This survey, carried out on the recipients who concluded the participation in the interventions during the year 2021, showed on the one hand some trends in continuity with the previous surveys and, on the other, some new elements.

Continuity with the previous surveys can be found in the results of projects financed under Action 3.1.1, which are better in terms of exit from housing difficulties rather than in terms of strengthening employability and increasing employment opportunities, as well as in the results of Action 3.3.1, which showed a good capacity of the Action to help the recipients to exit from the condition of social exclusion (also allowing to achieve better results than the targets set at the beginning of the Programme).

As regards the new elements, it is underlined how the capacity of the Program to have an important effect on the most vulnerable target groups appears to have been partially influenced by the heavy consequences of the Covid-19 pandemic. Although the Programme implemented valuable initiatives, which mitigated many critical and emergency situations, in the medium term seems to not have succeeded in "consolidating" the expected results for the final recipients, especially in the case of the most marginalised persons such as the Roma Sinti and Caminanti and the homeless.

Probably, the lockdown periods imposed by the regulations and the consequent greater difficulties in maintaining constant direct relationships over time, together with some delays in the resumption of activities, had the heaviest effects precisely on the weakest target groups, who most needed support and more regular interactions. In the absence of such support, the situations of extreme vulnerability ended up becoming chronic.

The results recorded for the Actions financed under Axis 3 show that, with regard to **Action 3.1.1 "Integrated actions against housing poverty"** 63% of the recipients of projects fighting housing difficulties had a positive outcome (national average for indicators IR11 and IR12), with an important improvement compared to the previous year and with no difference between persons belonging to jobless households (for which the target is set at 85%) and those with other types of disadvantage (target 90%). However, the differences across the territorial areas of the country are significant: for both categories of recipients, and both for men and women, the performance of the Developed Regions largely exceeds that of the Less Developed ones¹. The results were higher among the target group "jobless households" compared to the target group "other disadvantaged persons" (90% compared to 76% in the Developed Regions and 57% compared to 55% in the Less Developed ones). Considering males and females separately, within jobless families men had better outcomes than women (both in the Developed Regions and in the Less developed ones). Conversely, for "other disadvantaged people", the value of the indicator relating to the exit from housing difficulties is greater for women than for men (again in both territorial areas).

With reference to job placement and/or the attainment of a qualification, for both categories of recipients (indicators IR13 and IR14), the data at the end of 2022 show, on the national average, a clear decline compared to 2021. This trend derives mainly from the situation of Palermo, where a high number of recipients concluded their participation in 2022 but the projects were in fact focused on fighting housing poverty (and therefore did not tackle the employment issue). In the Developed Regions, the values of the indicators instead saw a slight increase; as already emerged with reference to the exit from housing difficulties, also in this case they were higher than those of the Less developed Regions. The Developed Regions also stand out for positive outcomes of the female group: the indicators reached 41% for "other disadvantaged people" (IR13), largely exceeding the expected target, and 33% for persons belonging to jobless families (percentage identical to the target).

¹ The result recorded in the Regions in Transition (Metropolitan City of Cagliari) is not mentioned because the number of recipients who concluded their participation in the project is very low and therefore the percentages are scarcely significant.

Indicators Action 3.1.1	Regions	Baseline	Target	Result as at 31.12.2021		
				Total	F	M
IR11 – Percentage of participants who are no longer housing-deprived one year after the conclusion of the intervention (CI17 Other disadvantaged)	Less developed	80%	90%	55%	64%	48%
	In transition	80%	90%	100%	--	100%
	Developed	80%	90%	76%	82%	60%
	Total Italy			63%	72%	51%
IR12 - Percentage of participants who are no longer housing-deprived one year after the conclusion of the intervention (CI12 Participants who live in jobless households)	Less developed	80%	85%	57%	55%	59%
	In transition	80%	85%	67%	50%	100%
	Developed	80%	85%	90%	83%	100%
	Total Italy			63%	60%	67%
IR13 - Percentage of participants who, within one year after the end of the intervention, have successfully completed the process of seeking employment and/or acquiring a qualification (CI17 Other disadvantaged) *	Less developed	0%	33%	7%	9%	5%
	In transition	0%	33%	0%	0%	0%
	Developed	0%	33%	32%	41%	5%
	Total Italy			15%	23%	5%
IR14 - Percentage of participants who, within one year after the end of the intervention, have successfully completed the process of seeking employment and/or acquiring a qualification (CI12 Participants who live in jobless households)	Less developed	0%	33%	0%	0%	0%
	In transition	0%	33%	50%	50%	50%
	Developed	0%	33%	20%	33%	0%
	Total Italy			6%	9%	2%

* The values presented in the table refer only to Action 3.1.1 and not to the whole Investment Priority 9i, to which also Action 3.4.1 is related. For the purposes of the AIR, in the Less Developed Regions the value of the indicator IR13 (CI17) for the Investment Priority 9i (which includes Actions 3.1.1 and 3.4.1) corresponds to 3,3% (4,0% F – 2,6% M).

With **Action 3.2.1 " Pathways to housing for marginalised communities"** the NOP Metropolitan Cities 2014-2020 financed interventions aimed at supporting the integration of individuals and families belonging to the Roma, Sinti and Caminanti communities among the other residents. The ultimate goal of the projects was to gradually reduce the number of families living in the camps, in line with the provisions of the National Strategy for equality, inclusion and participation of the Roma and Sinti (2021-2030), adopted by decree of 23 May 2022 implementing the Recommendation of the Council of the European Union of 12 March 2021 (2021/C 93/01).

The results achieved by the interventions in terms of increase of employability and employment of the recipients involved, in continuity with what had also emerged from the previous surveys, appear modest and still far from the expected target of 60% (indicator IR17), with similar results in the Developed Regions and in the Regions in Transition (represented only by the CM of Cagliari). In these

areas the share of recipients who, within one year of the conclusion of the intervention, had successfully completed the process of looking for a job and/or acquiring of a qualification is equal to 27%, with slightly better results for males compared to females (who are more difficult to involve in this type of intervention).

The results of interventions aimed at supporting the recipients in exiting from housing difficulties and abandoning the camps are also far from the target (high, set at 85%). The values of the indicator (IR15) are 59% in the Transition Regions and 35% in the Developed Regions, where the results saw a decline compared to the previous year. However, this modest result largely derives from the difficulties encountered by the Metropolitan City of Rome, which recorded a high number of recipients who completed the participation in 2021 but, following the pandemic, encountered significant difficulties in actually implementing the service agreements that had been stipulated. In fact, the health emergency situation increased the pre-existing housing difficulties of marginalised persons, which derived from the “freezing” of rental prices, from owners’ mistrust towards persons who did not offer particular guarantees beyond those of social services (the mistrust increased during the pandemic due to the lack of direct contacts and then remained over time) and, during the last year, also by the recovery of the tourism sector, which led to an increase in rental prices and to a preference, by the owners, for more profitable uses related to the tourism market.

Indicators Action 3.2.1	Regions	Baseline	Target	Result as at 31.12.2021		
				Total	F	M
IR15 - Percentage of participants who are no longer housing-deprived one year after the conclusion of the intervention (CI15 Migrants, people with a foreign background, minorities, including marginalised communities such as the Roma)	Less developed	80%	85%	-	-	-
	In transition	80%	85%	59%	75%	54%
	Developed	80%	85%	35%	36%	33%
	Total Italy			37%	38%	36%
IR17 - Percentage of participants who, within one year after the end of the intervention, have successfully completed the process of seeking employment and/or acquiring a qualification (CI15 Migrants, people with a foreign background, minorities, including marginalised communities such as the Roma)	Less developed	0%	60%	-	-	-
	In transition	0%	60%	29%	25%	31%
	Developed	0%	60%	26%	19%	35%
	Total Italy			27%	19%	34%

Also low-threshold interventions, financed through Action 3.2.2 "**Low-threshold services for the inclusion of the homeless or similar persons (foreigners in extreme housing emergency)**", recorded modest results regarding the exit from housing difficulties: the percentage of homeless persons who were no longer in a situation of housing difficulties one year after the conclusion of their participation in the project (indicator IR16) is 36% in the Less Developed Regions, 38% in the Transitions Regions and 44% in the Developed Regions, compared to a target of 85% set at the beginning of the Programme. This target, however, was defined on the basis of pure *Housing First* experiences, and does not consider the types of interventions that were actually financed under Axis 3 of the Programme, which focused on low- and very low-threshold services (street units, social emergency services, soup kitchens, dormitories, day centres, etc.) and primarily pursued the objectives of ensuring protection to persons taken in charge and addressing extremely marginalised persons, who are excluded from the circuit of social services and who could subsequently be included in more extensive and longer support paths.

Indicator Action 3.2.2	Regions	Baseline	Target	Result as at 31.12.2021		
				Total	F	M
IR16 - Percentage of participants who are no longer housing-deprived one year after the conclusion of the intervention (CI18 Homeless or affected by housing exclusion)	Less developed	80%	85%	36%	51%	29%
	In transition	80%	85%	38%	50%	33%
	Developed	80%	85%	44%	80%	31%
	Total Italy			37%	54%	30%

Action 3.3.1 " Support to the activation of new services in degraded areas ", through the activation of new proximity and inclusion services and collaborative social networks in districts and areas of the Metropolitan Cities characterised by situations of physical degradation and socio-economic marginality seems instead to have achieved good results. The selected indicator (IR18c), which measures the share of recipients involved in the network's activities who, one year after the end of the intervention, had exited the condition of exclusion in the total number of recipients, reached 67% in the Less Developed Regions and 77% in the Developed Regions (compared to an expected target of 20%). The initiatives implemented therefore showed a good contribution to the improvement of the urban fabric in areas of high social exclusion and low legality rate.

Indicators Action 3.3.1	Regions	Baseline	Target	Result as at 31.12.2021		
				Total	F	M
IR18b - Percentage of networks operating one year after the end of the intervention (CI20 Number of projects fully or partially implemented by social partners or non-governmental organisations)	Less developed	0%	20%	-	-	-
	In transition	0%	20%	-	-	-
	Developed	0%	20%	87%	-	-
	Total Italy			87%	-	-
IR18c - Percentage of disadvantaged individuals who are involved in the activities of the network and who, 12 months after the end of the intervention, are no longer in a condition of exclusion in Total of disadvantaged individuals involved	Less developed	0%	20%	67%	57%	80%
	In transition	0%	20%	-	-	-
	Developed	0%	20%	77%	80%	75%
	Total Italy			77%	78%	75%

Finally, with regard to Action 3.4.1 **"Innovative social services to support multi-problem families and/or particularly disadvantaged or discriminated people"** included in the Programme updating of September 2020 (version 6.0 of the NOP Metropolitan cities 2014-2020) for only the Less Developed Regions, the result measured by the indicator (IR13) was not achieved, since the projects which recorded recipients concluding the participation in 2021 did not have, among their objectives, the searching for a job and/or the acquisition of a qualification. The projects surveyed, in full continuity with those observed in the previous survey, actually focused in supporting families and parents in order to avoid the removal of minors from the family nucleus (this is the case of the service *Home maker*, in the Metropolitan City of Bari), or in providing home services to minors with disabilities and their families (the SEMI project, also in Bari), or in facilitating the use of all services provided by the social and healthcare networks by disadvantaged people (as happens for the social operations Centre in Naples). None of these projects launched specific activities aimed at enhancing employability and/or job placement of the recipients.

Indicator Action 3.4.1	Regions	Baseline	Target	Result as at 31.12.2021		
				Total	F	M
IR13 - Percentage of participants who, within one year after the end of the intervention, have successfully completed the process of seeking employment and/or acquiring a qualification (CI17 Other disadvantaged)*	Less developed	0%	33%	0%*	0%*	0%*
	In transition **	-	-	-	-	-
	Developed **	-	-	-	-	-
	Dato Italia			0%	0%	0%

* The values presented in the table refer only to Action 3.4.1 and not to the whole Investment Priority 9i, to which also Action 3.1.1 is related. For the purposes of the AIR, in the Less Developed Regions the value of the indicator IR13 (CI17) for the Investment Priority 9i (which includes Actions 3.1.1 and 3.4.1) corresponds to 3,3% (4,0% F – 2,6% M).

** Specific Objective 3.4 refers only to the Less Developed Regions.